

# alaska judicial council

1029 W. Third Avenue, Suite 201, Anchorage, Alaska 99501-1969 http://www.ajc.state.ak.us

(907)279-2526 FAX (907)276-5046 E-mail: postmaster@ajc.state.ak.us

## Alaska Judicial Council Appellate Judge Questionnaire

## 2012 Candidates for Judicial Retention

### October 2011

Joel H. Bolger Name Alaska Court of Appeals Court

1. Please estimate your workload during your present term.

a) \_\_\_% civil cases b) \_\_\_# of trials/year (as trial judge, if any) \_\_\_\_% court administrative work \_\_\_% Total

2. Please describe your participation on court/bar committees or other administrative activities during your current term of office

For the court system, I serve as the Chair of the Conference Planning Committee and as a member of the Appellate Rules Committee, the Criminal Pattern Jury Instructions Committee, and the Fairness Diversity & Equality Committee. During this term, I planned several judicial conferences and personally presented programs on Recent Appellate Decisions and Search Warrants for Electronic Data.

For the Alaska Bar Association, I serve on the Bar Convention Steering Committee and the Continuing Legal Education Committee. I served as a judge for the Statewide Mock Trial Competition and sat on panels for bar association programs entitled Appellate Off-the-Record and Increasing Diversity in Alaska's Judiciary. I am scheduled to serve on a panel presentation for new appellate lawyers in November 2011. 3. Please assess, in one or two paragraphs, your judicial performance during your present term. Appropriate areas of comment could include: satisfaction with your judicial role, specific contributions to the judiciary or the field of law, increases in legal knowledge and judicial skills, or other measures of judicial abilities that you believe to be important.

On the court of appeals, I have written over 150 opinions and memorandum decisions on criminal law issues, as well as participating in over 300 decisions written by the other two judges. In 2009, I sat on two cases with the Alaska Supreme Court and wrote the opinions in Smallwood v. Central Peninsula General Hosp., 227 P.3d 457 (Alaska 2010) and Henrichs v. Chugach Alaska Corp., 2011 WL 3795531(Alaska Aug. 26, 2011).

It has been a great honor for me to serve on a multi-judge court and to consider legal issues of statewide significance. During this process, I have tried to maintain the proper deference to the opinions of my colleagues, to the importance of precedent, to the special competencies of legislative and executive branch officials, and to the factual determinations of lower courts and juries.

- 4. During your most recent term as a judge, have you:
  - a) had a tax lien filed or other collection procedure instituted against you by federal, state, or local authorities?  $\Box$  Yes  $\swarrow$  No
  - b) been involved in a non-judicial capacity in any legal proceeding whether as a party or otherwise? □ Yes ☑ No

c) engaged in the practice of law (other than as a judge)?  $\Box$  Yes  $\checkmark$  No

d) held office in any political party?  $\Box$  Yes  $\checkmark$  No

e) held any other local, state or federal office?  $\Box$  Yes  $\checkmark$  No

- f) had any complaints, charges or grievances filed against you with the Alaska
  Commission on Judicial Conduct, the Alaska Bar Association, or with the Alaska Court
  System that resulted in public proceedings or sanctions? □ Yes V No
- 5. If your answer to any of the questions above is "yes," please give full details, including dates, facts, case numbers and outcomes.

6. Please provide any other information which you believe would assist the Council in conducting its evaluations and in preparing its recommendations for the 2012 retention elections.

Thank you for the time you volunteer for these important evaluations.

#### For questions 7 and 8, please do not list any cases that have pending issues in your court.

7. Please list your six most recent opinions including case names and numbers. Please list the names, current addresses, including zip codes and suite numbers where applicable, of each attorney involved in these appeals. (Attach additional pages if necessary.)

	Case Nu	mber 1	
Case Name:	Robert Henrichs	Case Number:	S-12878
<i>v</i> .	Chugach Alaska Corporation		
	Attorneys 1	Involved:	
Name:	Frederick Triem	Name:	Robert Hume
Address:	PO Box 129	- Address:	701 West 8th Ave. Ste. 1200
City, State, Zip:	Petersburg, Alaska 99833	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
Name:		Name:	
Address:		- Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	
	<b>•</b> • • •		
	Case Nu	mber 2	
Case Name:	Yosbany Moore	Case Number:	A-10351
<i>v</i> .	State of Alaska		
	Attorneys 1	nvolved:	
Name:	Beth Trimmer	Name:	Tamara de Lucia
Address:	1016 West 6th Ave., Ste. 100	Address:	310 K Street, Suite 308
City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
Name:		Name:	
Address:		Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	
	Case Nul		
Case Name:	Darren Shay	Case Number:	A-10380
<i>v</i>	State of Alaska		
	Attorneys I	nvolved:	
Name:	Margi Mock	Name:	Diane Wendlandt
Address:	900 West 5th Ave., Ste. 200	Address:	310 K Street, Suite 308
City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
Name:		Name:	
Address:		Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	

	Case Nu	mber 4	
Case Name:	Thomas Beattie	Case Number:	A-10505
<i>v</i> .	State of Alaska		
	Attorneys I	nvolved:	
Name:	Jane Martinez		Diane Wendlandt
Address:	PO Box 113201	- Address:	310 K Street, Suite 308
City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99511	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
Name:		Nama	
Address:	······	. Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	
		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
	Case Nur	nber 5	
Case Name:	Brenda Cleveland	Case Number:	A-10466
v.	State of Alaska		
-	Attorneys Ii	nvolved.	
Name:	Jane Martinez	Name:	Tamara de Lucia
- Address:	PO Box 113201	Address:	310 K Street, Suite 308
City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99511	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
-			
Name:		Name:	
Address:		Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	
	•		
	Case Nun	nber 6	
Case Name:	Winona Fletcher	Case Number:	A-10455
<i>v.</i>	State of Alaska		
	Attorneys In	wolved:	
Name:	Beth Trimmer	Name:	Nancy Simel
Address:	1016 West 6th Ave., Ste. 100	Address:	310 K Street, Suite 308
City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501	City, State, Zip:	Anchorage, Alaska 99501
Name:		Name:	
Address:		Address:	
City, State, Zip:		City, State, Zip:	

## Alaska Judicial Council Recommendation Judge Joel H. Bolger, Alaska Court of Appeals

#### Judicial Council Recommendation 2012

The Alaska Judicial Council is a non-partisan citizens' commission established by the Alaska constitution. Alaskan law requires the Council to evaluate judges' performance and authorizes the Council to recommend to voters whether judges should be retained in office. The Judicial Council reviews judges' integrity, diligence, legal ability, fairness, demeanor, ability to manage their caseloads, and overall performance of their judicial responsibilities in and out of the courtroom. The Judicial Council finds Judge Bolger to be **Qualified** and recommends unanimously that the public vote "**YES**" to retain him as a court of appeals judge.

#### **Judicial Council Evaluation**

The Judicial Council surveyed thousands of Alaskans including peace and probation officers, court employees, attorneys, jurors, social workers and guardians ad litem about the judges on the ballot. Respondents were asked to rate judicial performance and to submit comments. The Council also reviewed the ratings and observations of the Alaska Judicial Observers, independent community-based volunteers. The Council reviewed the judge's peremptory challenge, recusals, and appellate affirmance and reversal rates; any civil or criminal litigation involving the judge; APOC and court system conflict-of-interest statements; any disciplinary files involving the judge; and whether a judge's pay was withheld for an untimely decision. The Council reviewed other court records and investigated judicial conduct in specific cases. The Council interviewed some judges, attorneys, and court staff, and held a statewide public hearing to obtain comments about judges.

	Attorney Survey	Court Employee Survey
Legal Ability	4.4	
Impartiality	4.3	4.9
Integrity	4.5	4.9
Temperament	4.5	4.9
Diligence	4.5	4.8
Overall	4.4	4.9

Ratings are based on a one to five scale. Five is the best							
rating and three is							
"acceptable."							
<b>Rating Scale</b>							
5.0 = Excellent							
<b>4.0 = Good</b>							
3.0 = Acceptable							
2.0 = Deficient							
<b>1.0 = Poor</b>							

#### **Summary of Survey Information**

Survey respondents rated Judge Bolger on the categories summarized in the table above, using 5 as the highest rating possible. The attorney rating for Judge Bolger on overall performance was 4.4. Court employees gave him 4.9.

### Recommendation: Vote "YES" to retain Judge Joel Bolger

	Leş Abi		Impart Fair		Integ	grity	Judi Temper		Dilig	ence	Ove Evalu	
	Mean	Ň	Mean	N	Mean	N	Mean	Ν	Mean	N	Mean	N
<b>Basis for Evaluation</b>												
No Response		0		0		0		0		0		C
Direct Professional	4.4	140	4.3	141	4.5	140	4.5	139	4.5	130	4.4	143
Experience in last 5 yrs	4.4	119	4.3	120	4.5	119	4.4	118	4.5	110	4.3	121
Experience not in last 5 yrs	4.2	19	4.4	19	4.4	19	4.5	19	4.5	18	4.3	19
Professional Reputation	4.3	44	4.3	43	4.4	41	4.4	42	4.3	38	4.4	45
Other Personal Contacts	4.7	9	4.6	10	4.6	10	4.8	10	4.7	10	4.7	10
Type of Practice												
No Response		5		4		5		6		15		2
Private, Solo	3.8	23	3.7	23	4.3	23	4.1	24	4.2	22	3.8	25
Private, 2-5 Attorneys	3.6	13	3.6	14	3.7	14	3.6	14	3.8	14	3.6	14
Private, 6+ Attorneys	4.7	11	4.8	11	4.9	11	4.9	9	5.0	9	4.7	11
Private, Corporate Employee	4.0	1	4.0	1	4.0	1	5.0	1	5.0	1	4.0	1
Judge or Judicial Officer	4.7	42	4.7	42	4.8	42	4.7	41	4.8	37	4.8	42
Government	4.5	43	4.4	43	4.6	42	4.5	43	4.6	40	4.4	43
Public Service Agency/Org		0		0		0		0		0		(
Other	4.5	4	4.5	4	4.5	4	4.3	4	4.5	4	4.5	4
Years of Practice in Alaska												
No Response		15		4		5		5		14		2
5 Years or fewer	4.2	6	4.4	5	4.6	5	4.7	6	4.7	6	4.2	e
6 to 10 years	4.0	8	3.7	9	4.3	9	3.9	8	4.3	8	3.9	8
11 to 15 years	4.1	4	4.1	14	4.4	14	4.1	14	4.5	12	4.1	14
16 to 20 years	4.3	12	4.1	12	4.5	12	4.6	11	4.4	11	4.2	12
21 years or more	4.5	90	4.5	91	4.6	90	4.5	91	4.6	84	4.5	93
Gender												
No Response		5		4		5		5		14		2
Male	4.4	94	4.4	96	4.5	95	4.4	95	4.5	89	4.4	98
Female	4.4	43	4.3	42	4.6	42	4.5	42	4.5	39	4.4	42
Cases Handled										• /		
No Response		5		4		5		6		14		2
Prosecution	5.0	9	4.9	9	5.0	8	4.9	9	4.9	8	5.0	Ģ
Mainly Criminal	4.0	14	3.7	13	4.0	13	3.9	14	4.5	14	3.7	13
Mixed Criminal & Civil	4.3	61	4.3	61	4.4	61	4.3	59	4.4	53	4.3	62
Mainly Civil	4.5	40	4.6	42	4.7	42	4.7	42	4.6	41	4.5	43
Other	4.6	9	4.7	9	4.8	9	4.8	8	4.8	8	4.7	9
Location of Practice	4.0	,	/		7.0		4.0	0	4.0	0	т./	-
No Response		5		4		5		6		15		4
First District	4.5	12	4.5	12	4.7	11	4.6	11	4.6	8	4.4	12
Second District	4.3 5.0	12	4.5 5.0	2	4.7 5.0	2	4.0 5.0	2	4.0 5.0	8 2	4.4 5.0	1.
Third District	3.0 4.4	102	4.3	103	3.0 4.5	103	3.0 4.5	102	3.0 4.5	2 97	3.0 4.4	104
Fourth District		20										
Outside of Alaska	4.2 5.0	20	4.1 5.0	20 1	4.3 5.0	20 1	4.0 5.0	20 1	4.3 5.0	19 1	4.0 5.0	21 1

#### Judge Joel H. Bolger: Detailed Information Responses Alaska Bar Association Members

Note: Ratings for only those respondents who reported direct professional experience with the judge.

Distribution of Court Employee Ratings* 2012 Retention Evaluation Joel H. Bolger										
	Number of Responses									
Survey Category	Category Total Excellent Good Acceptable Deficient Poor Mean									
Impartiality/Fairness	33	30	2	1	0	0	4.9			
Integrity	32	30	1	1	0	0	4.9			
Judicial Temperament	33	30	2	1	0	0	4.9			
Diligence	32	28	3	1	0	0	4.8			
Overall Evaluation	33	31	1	1	0	0	4.9			

\* Ratings are based on direct professional experience.

## **Current and Prior Retention Scores**

## Joel H. Bolger

Appointed	Name of Court
7/3/1997	Valdez District Ct
9/2/2003	Kodiak Superior Ct
8/29/2008	Ct of Appeals

#### **Retention Attorney Bar Scores**

Year	Legal Ability	Impartiality	Integrity	Temperament	Dilligence	Special Skills	<b>Overall Performance</b>
2000	4.4	4.5	4.5	4.6	4.5	4.6	4.5
2006	4.4	4.5	4.6	4.5	4.5		4.5
2012	4.4	4.3	4.5	4.5	4.5		4.4

#### Peace and Probation Officer Survey Scores

 Year	Impartiality	Integrity	Temperament	Diligence	Special Skills	<b>Overall Performance</b>
 2000	4.5	4.5	4.6	4.5	4.3	4.4
2006	4.4	4.7	4.5	4.6		4.6
2012						