Alaska Judicial Council 2010 Judicial Retention Performance Evaluation Materials Judge David Mannheimer Alaska Court of Appeals

The Judicial Council finds Judge Mannheimer to be **Qualified** and recommends unanimously that the public vote **"YES"** to retain him as an appellate court judge.

Retention evaluation materials for this judge

1. Voter p	pamphlet page	2
_	questionnaire	3
3. Survey ^{(To}	scores in 2010 view survey scores for all judges on the ballot go to main 2010 retention page.)	
a.	Attorney scores.	15
b.	Court employee survey scores	18
4. Survey	scores in previous retention evaluations	19

Retention evaluation materials for all judges on the ballot

(To view these materials go to main 2010 retention page.)

1. Peremptory challenges

Analysis of peremptory challenge rates for judges.

2. Recusals

Evaluation of judge's record of self-disqualification from cases, or "recusals."

3. Appellate Affirmance Rates

Analysis of appellate decisions involving each trial judge's cases.

4. Salary Warrant Withholdings

Evaluation of judge's record of pay withholding for undecided or uncompleted decisions.

Alaska Judicial Council Recommendation

Judge David Mannheimer, Court of Appeals Judge

Judicial Council Recommendation 2010

The Alaska Judicial Council is a non-partisan citizens' commission established by the Alaska constitution. Alaskan law requires the Council to evaluate judges' performance and authorizes the Council to recommend to voters whether judges should be retained in office. The Judicial Council reviews judges' integrity, diligence, legal ability, fairness, demeanor, ability to manage their caseloads, and overall performance of their judicial responsibilities in and out of the courtroom. The Judicial Council finds Judge Mannheimer to be *Qualified* and recommends unanimously that the public vote "YES" to retain him as a court of appeals judge.

Judicial Council Evaluation

The Judicial Council surveyed thousands of Alaskans including peace and probation officers, court employees, attorneys, jurors, social workers/guardians ad litem, and child advocates about the judges on the ballot. Respondents were asked to rate judicial performance and to submit comments. The Council also reviewed the ratings and observations of the Alaska Judicial Observers, independent community-based volunteers. The Council reviewed the judge's peremptory challenge, recusals, and appellate affirmance and reversal rates; any civil or criminal litigation involving the judge; APOC and court system conflict-of-interest statements; any disciplinary files involving the judge; and whether a judge's pay was withheld for an untimely decision. The Council reviewed other court records and investigated judicial conduct in specific cases. The Council interviewed some judges, attorneys, and court staff, and held a statewide public hearing to obtain comments about judges.

	Attorney Survey	Court Employee Survey
Legal Ability	4.5	
Impartiality	4.3	4.6
Integrity	4.5	4.7
Temperament	4.3	4.4
Diligence	4.6	4.7
Overall	4.4	4.7

Ratings are based on a one to five scale. Five is the best rating and three is "acceptable."

Rating Scale

5.0 = Excellent

4.0 = Good

3.0 = Acceptable

2.0 = Deficient

1.0 = Poor

Summary of Survey Information

Survey respondents rated Judge Mannheimer on the categories summarized in the table above, using 5 as the highest rating possible. The attorney rating for Judge Mannheimer on overall performance was 4.4. Court employees rated him at 4.7.

Recommendation: Vote "YES" to retain Judge David Mannheimer

Alaska Judicial Council Questionnaire

Appellate Judge 2010 Candidates for Judicial Retention

October 22, 2009

David Mannheimer	Court of Appeals
Name	Court
Please estimate your workload during y	your present term.
a) % civil cases 85-90 % criminal cases 10-15 % court administrative we 100 % Total	b)# of trials/year (as trial judge, if any) ork
Note: In my total of "criminal" cases, I have include are technically civil).	ded the appeals in post-conviction relief cases (which
2. Please describe your participation on couduring your current term of office.	urt/bar committees or other administrative activities
Alaska Bar Association Committee on the Rules of Supreme Court Committee on the Rules of Crimin Committee to Re-Design the Appellate Court Cas Steering Committee of the Khabarovsk-Alaska Rule annual training of new appellate court law clerks occasional training presentations for magistrates	nal Procedure se Management System ule of Law Partnership

Alaska Judicial Council Appellate Judge Questionnaire Retention

3. Please assess, in one or two paragraphs, your judicial performance during your present term. Appropriate areas of comment could include: satisfaction with your judicial role, specific contributions to the judiciary or the field of law, increases in legal knowledge and judicial skills, or other measures of judicial abilities that you believe to be important.

I am now several months past 60. Because the Alaska Constitution requires judges to retire at age 70, the retention election in November 2010 will be my last.

I have now been a judge for almost nineteen years — half of my adult life. I am profoundly grateful for these years. I have done my best to serve my community: to see justice done for the people who appeared in my court, and to write appellate opinions that contributed to the clarity and the health of the law.

In the process, I think that I have grown as a lawyer and as a human being. My work requires me to repeatedly examine and analyze the working of our judicial system; it requires me to carefully consider points of view other than my own; it requires me to clearly articulate and explain my legal conclusions; and it requires me to ponder the long-term consequences of my court's decisions for the judicial system as a whole.

Because essentially all of my judicial decisions are communicated in writing, I continue to consciously work on my writing skills. An appellate court's decisions affect people's lives (often irrevocably), and our decisions set the rules for future cases. It is therefore crucial that we explain ourselves clearly — so that everyone will know what we decided and, perhaps more important, why we decided the case that way. To improve my writing, I take CLE courses and read books and articles on writing, and I also read a lot of literature in general — mostly history, biography, and historical fiction.

I also try to stay current with new technology, and to investigate ways in which that technology might be used to improve the judicial system. Early this year, I worked with court system personnel to develop a system for scanning trial court files in criminal cases when an appeal is filed, and then numbering the electronic images. As a result, we no longer require the trial court clerk's office to physically number every page of the trial court file, and we no longer require attorneys to spend long hours at the Appellate Court Clerk's Office, examining the trial court file and asking for photocopies of the pages they need. Instead, we are able to give the attorneys (and their clients, if they wish) a CD containing an electronic version of the trial court file — in text-searchable Adobe PDF format. This new system has been in place since March and, so far, attorney reaction has been very favorable.

All in all, after nineteen years on the court, I continue to love my work, and I continue to feel very grateful to have found a profession that is so personally rewarding and that allows me to contribute something important to society.

4.	During	g your most recent term as a judge, have you:
	a)	had a tax lien filed or other collection procedure instituted against you by federal, state, or local authorities? ☐ Yes ✓ No
	b)	been involved in a non-judicial capacity in any legal proceeding whether as a party or otherwise? ✓ Yes □ No
	c)	engaged in the practice of law (other than as a judge)? ☐ Yes 🌠 No
	d)	held office in any political party? □ Yes 🌠 No
	e)	held any other local state or federal office? □ Yes ♥ No
	f)	had any complaints, charges or grievances filed against you with the Alaska Commission on Judicial Conduct, the Alaska Bar Association, or with the Alaska Court System that resulted in public proceedings or sanctions?
	dates,	r answer to any of the questions above is "yes," please give full details, including facts, case numbers and outcomes. 4(b): In early December 2005, I received (and paid) a traffic ticket for rolling through a stop
sign.		į
		provide any other information which you believe would assist the Council in eting its evaluations and in preparing its recommendations for the 2010 retention ins.

7. Please list your six most recent opinions including case names and numbers. Please list the names, current addresses, including zip codes and suite numbers where applicable, and phone numbers of each attorney involved in these appeals. (Attach additional pages if necessary.)

Case Number 1

you ask for Case Number: to put them in	this form.
t there is no place	
Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	
Address:	
City, State, Zip:	
Name:	
City, State, Zip:	
Case Number 2	
Case Number:	
Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	
Name:	
Case Number 3	
Case Number:	
Attantant Involved	
City, State, Zip:	
Name:	
Address:	
City, State, Zip:	
	t there is no place Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number 2 Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number 3 Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address:

	Case Number 4	
Case Name:	Case Number:	
ν.		
	Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	Name:	
Address:	Address:	
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	
Name:	Name:	
Address:		
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	
	Case Number 5	
Case Name:	Case Number:	
ν	Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	·	
Address:	Address	
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	
Name:		
Address:		
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	
		- 1
Case	Case Number 6	
Name:	Case Number:	
ν		
	Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	Name:	
Address:	Address:	*****
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	
Name:	Name:	
Address:	Address:	
City, State, Zip:	City, State, Zip:	

My Most Recent Judicial Opinions

Published Opinions

Espinal v. State Court of Appeals File No. A-10606 Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2245 (November 17, 2009) P.3d Krista Maciolek Brittany L. Dunlop **Assistant District Attorney** Assistant Public Advocate 1517 Industrial Way, Unit #1 310 K Street, Suite 520 Palmer, AK 99645-6665 Anchorage, AK 99501-1975 907-269-6300 907-745-0435 Moore v. State Court of Appeals File No. A-10200 Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2243 (October 2, 2009) P.3d

David D. Reineke Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400 Amy M. Williams
Assistant Attorney General
Criminal Division Central Office
P.O. Box 110300
Juneau, AK 99811-0300
907-465-3428

Skjervem v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-9972
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2237 (September 18, 2009)
215 P.3d 1101

Renee McFarland Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400 Timothy W. Terrell
Assistant Attorney General
Office of Special Prosecutions &
Appeals
310 K Street, Suite 308
Anchorage, AK 99501-2064
907-269-6250

Jones v. State

Court of Appeals File No. A-10142 Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2239 (September 18, 2009) 215 P.3d 1091

Renee McFarland Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Tamara E. de Lucia Assistant Attorney General Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250

Ferrick v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-9976
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2240 (September 18, 2009)
217 P.3d 418

James W. McGowan 202-A Katlian Street Sitka, AK 99835 907-747-8650 W. H. Hawley Assistant Attorney General Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250

Rantala v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-9769
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2236 (September 18, 2009)
216 P.3d 550

Marjorie Allard Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400 Blair M. Christensen Assistant Public Advocate 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 525 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-269-3500

Note: At the time of this litigation, Ms. Christensen was employed by the Department of Law State v. Hamilton
Court of Appeals File No. A-10268
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2235 (September 18, 2009)
216 P.3d 547

David L. Brower Assistant Attorney General Criminal Division Central Office P.O. Box 110300 Juneau, AK 99811-0300 907-465-3428 Renee McFarland Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Jane E. Sebens
Assistant City Attorney
City and Borough of Juneau
155 South Seward St.
Juneau, AK 99801
907-586-0275

Memorandum Opinions

Evans v. State Court of Appeals File No. A-10076 Court of Appeals Memorandum Opinion No. 5543 (November 18, 2009) 2009 WL

Josie Garton (briefing) Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250 Sarah Sheshunoff (oral argument)

Diane L. Wendlandt

Assistant Attorney General

Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Grierson v. State Court of Appeals File No. A-10370 Court of Appeals Memorandum Opinion No. 5523 (September 30, 2009) 2009 WL 3164860

Kevin Higgins Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Angie Kemp **Assistant District Attorney** P.O. Box 110300 Juneau, AK 99811-0300 907-465-3620

Wyagon v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-10093
Court of Appeals Memorandum Opinion No. 5519 (September 23, 2009)
2009 WL 3065203

Josie Garton Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400 Tamara de Lucia Assistant Attorney General Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250

Tocktoo v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-9937
Court of Appeals Memorandum Opinion No. 5520 (September 23, 2009)
2009 WL 3065206

Michael M. Moberly 134 West 15th Avenue Anchorage, AK 99501-5106 907-339-7200

Timothy W. Terrell
Assistant Attorney General
Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals
310 K Street, Suite 308
Anchorage, AK 99501-2064
907-269-6250

Alaska Judicial Council Appellate Judge Questionnaire Retention

8. Optional: If you deem it helpful to the Council, please list up to three other cases during your past term in which you believe your work was particularly noteworthy. Please list the names, current addresses, including zip codes and suite numbers where applicable, and phone numbers of each attorney involved in these appeals. (Attach additional pages if necessary.)

Case Number 1

Casa Numban	
Cuse Numver:	
Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	
City, State, Zip:	
Name:	
Case Number 2	
Case Number:	
	•
Attorneys Involved:	
Name:	
Address:	
City, State, Zip:	
Name:	
Case Number 3	
Case Number:	P. C.
Attornevs Involved:	
•	
Address:	
City, State, Zip:	
Name:	
Address:	
City, State, Zip:	
	Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number 2 Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number 3 Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Case Number: Attorneys Involved: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip: Name: Address: City, State, Zip:

Three Other Significant Opinions

State v. Pease
Court of Appeals File No. A-08905
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2112 (July 27, 2007)
163 P.3d 985

W. H. Hawley
Assistant Attorney General
Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals
310 K Street, Suite 308
Anchorage, AK 99501-2064
907-269-6250

Lori M. Bodwell Office of Public Advocacy 100 Cushman Street, Suite 306 Fairbanks, AK 99701 907-458-6874

Brown v. State
Court of Appeals File No. A-09529
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2157 (April 18, 2008)
182 P.3d 624

Sharon Barr Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400 Kenneth M. Rosenstein Assistant Attorney General Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250

State v. Batts
Court of Appeals File No. A-09682
Court of Appeals Published Opinion No. 2189 (October 31, 2008)
195 P.3d 144

W. H. Hawley Assistant Attorney General Office of Special Prosecutions & Appeals 310 K Street, Suite 308 Anchorage, AK 99501-2064 907-269-6250

Margi A. Mock Assistant Public Defender 900 West 5th Avenue, Suite 200 Anchorage, AK 99501 907-334-4400

Appellate Courts David Mannheimer - Alaska Court of Appeals

Summary Sheet and Detailed Survey Scores

Summary of survey information

Judge Mannheimer's detailed survey scores from attorneys follow. Attorneys rated him 4.4 on overall performance. Peace and probation officers and social workers, Guardians ad Litem and CASA volunteers do not rate justices or appellate judges.

	Attorney Survey N=167
Legal Ability	4.5
Impartiality	4.3
Integrity	4.5
Temperament	4.3
Diligence	4.6
Overall	4.4

The Judicial Council's Evaluation Process

State law requires the Judicial Council to evaluate each judge standing for retention, and to report its evaluations to the voters. The surveys reported here are an important part of the Council's evaluations. The Council also considers survey ratings by court employees and public comments. Along with the personal observations of the hundreds of people who had direct professional experience with the judge, the Council reviews any litigation involving the judge, conflict of interest records, and public disciplinary files. All of the evaluation information about the judge is on the Council's website at www.ajc.state.ak.us.

Alaska Court of Appeals Judge David Mannheimer

A. Alaska Bar Association Demographic Description

		N	%
Type of Practice			
	No Response	3	1.1%
	Private, Solo	34	12.6%
	Private, 2-5 Attorneys	23	8.6%
	Private, 6+ Attorneys	30	11.2%
	Private, Corporate Employee	8	3.0%
	Judge or Judicial Officer	67	24.9%
	Government	82	30.5%
	Public Service Agency or Organization	7	2.6%
	(Not Govt)		
	Other	15	5.6%
Length of Alaska Practice			
	No Response	8	3.0%
	5 Years or fewer	31	11.5%
	6 to 10 years	21	7.8%
	11 to 15 years	22	8.2%
	16 to 20 years	28	10.4%
	21 years or more	159	59.1%
Gender			
	No Response	5	1.9%
	Male	175	65.1%
	Female	89	33.1%
Cases Handled			
	No Response	3	1.1%
	Prosecution	26	9.7%
	Mainly Criminal	34	12.6%
	Mixed Criminal & Civil	91	33.8%
	Mainly Civil	99	36.8%
	Other	16	5.9%
Location of Practice			
	No Response	2	.7%
	First District	28	10.4%
	Second District	6	2.2%
	Third District	200	74.3%
	Fourth District	28	10.4%
	Outside of Alaska	5	1.9%

Judge David Mannheimer: Detailed Information Responses Alaska Bar Association Members

	Leş Abi		Impart Fairr	•	/ Integrity		Judi Temper		nt Diligence		Overall Evaluation	
	Mean	N	Mean	N	Mean	N	Mean	N	Mean	N	Mean	N
Basis for Evaluation												
No Response		3		0		2		3		6		0
Direct Professional	4.5	164	4.3	167	4.5	165	4.3	164	4.6	161	4.4	167
Professional Reputation	4.6	75	4.5	75	4.7	76	4.6	74	4.6	70	4.6	76
Other Personal Contacts	4.8	22	4.7	22	5.0	24	4.8	24	4.9	22	4.8	25
Type of Practice												
No Response		2		0		0		1		4		0
Private, Solo	4.1	20	3.8	20	4.3	20	4.0	20	4.1	20	3.9	20
Private, 2-5 Attorneys	4.6	13	4.1	13	4.2	13	4.2	13	4.6	13	4.3	13
Private, 6+ Attorneys	4.7	16	4.6	16	4.8	16	4.4	16	4.7	16	4.7	16
Private, Corporate Employee	4.5	4	4.5	4	4.8	4	4.5	4	4.3	4	4.5	4
Judge or Judicial Officer	4.7	53	4.6	55	4.8	55	4.5	54	4.8	51	4.6	55
Government	4.3	47	4.0	47	4.4	45	4.1	45	4.4	45	4.2	47
Public Service Agency or												
Organization (Not Govt)	5.0	3	5.0	3	5.0	3	5.0	3	5.0	3	5.0	3
Other	4.7	6	4.0	7	4.1	7	4.4	7	4.6	7	4.0	7
Years of Practice in Alaska												
No Response		2		0		0		1		3		0
5 Years or fewer	4.5	12	4.3	12	4.6	11	4.1	11	4.6	11	4.5	12
6 to 10 years	4.5	12	3.8	12	4.3	12	3.9	12	4.5	12	4.1	12
11 to 15 years	4.2	14	3.8	15	4.4	14	4.3	14	4.5	13	4.0	15
16 to 20 years	4.3	18	4.1	18	4.3	18	4.1	18	4.4	18	4.1	18
21 years or more	4.6	101	4.5	103	4.6	103	4.4	102	4.6	100	4.5	103
Gender												
No Response		1		0		1		2		4		0
Male	4.5	109	4.3	110	4.5	109	4.3	108	4.5	106	4.3	110
Female	4.6	51	4.3	53	4.5	52	4.2	52	4.6	51	4.5	53
Cases Handled												
No Response		0		0		0		0		0		0
Prosecution	4.1	16	3.9	17	4.5	15	4.1	15	4.4	15	4.1	17
Mainly Criminal	4.8	22	4.3	22	4.5	22	4.5	22	4.6	22	4.5	22
Mixed Criminal & Civil	4.4	71	4.1	73	4.4	73	4.1	72	4.5	69	4.2	73
Mainly Civil	4.6	44	4.5	44	4.8	44	4.5	44	4.6	44	4.7	44
Other	4.8	8	4.9	8	4.9	8	4.9	8	4.9	8	4.9	8
Location of Practice												
No Response		2		0		1		1		3		0
First District	4.6	18	4.4	18	4.8	17	4.5	16	4.7	17	4.4	18
Second District	4.7	3	4.7	3	5.0	3	4.7	3	5.0	1	4.7	3
Third District	4.5	119	4.3	121	4.6	120	4.3	120	4.6	118	4.4	121
Fourth District	4.2	18	3.7	19	4.0	19	3.6	19	4.2	19	3.8	19
Outside of Alaska	5.0	7	4.5	4	5.0	4	5.0	4	5.0	4	4.8	4

Note: Ratings for only those respondents who reported direct professional experience with the judge.

Court Employee Survey Results 2010 Retention Evaluation David Mannheimer

Question	Exce %	llent (n)	Go %	od (n)	Acce	ptable (n)	Defic	cient (n)	P 6	oor (n)	Mean	Total Responses
Impartiality/Fairness	73%	33	18%	8	9%	4	0%	0	0%	0	4.6	45
Integrity	77%	36	15%	7	9%	4	0%	0	0%	0	4.7	47
Judicial Temperament	62%	29	23%	11	11%	5	4%	2	0%	0	4.4	47
Diligence	80%	35	11%	5	9%	4	0%	0	0%	0	4.7	44
Overall Evaluation	78%	36	15%	7	4%	2	2%	1	0%	0	4.7	46

Prior Retention Scores

Judge David Mannheimer Court of Appeals: Retention 2010 Appointed to Court of Appeals 1990

Bar Survey										
2010 Retention	4.5	4.3	4.5	4.3	4.6	4.4				
2002 Retention	4.3	4.1	4.3	4.2	4.5	4.2				
1994 Retention	4.2	3.8	4.2	4.1	4.0	4.0				
	Legal Ability	Impartiality	Integrity	Judicial Temperament	Diligence	Overall Performance				

Peace & Probation Officer Survey

Peace and Probation officers do not rate appellate judges